Based on work with Bern, Broedel, Chiodaroli, Dennen, Dixon, Johansson, Gunaydin, Ferrara, Kallosh, Roiban, and Tseytlin Interplay with work by





Stanford Institute for Theoretical Physics Breaking of supersymmetry and Ultraviolet Divergences in extended Supergravity (BUDS)



Status update on U(I) duality satisfaction of BIK N=2 Born-Infeld action from 2001

easy to see duality invariance of W^(10) term
hints that hidden supersymmetry => duality
invariance (see Toine, Eric, Renata talks)

Bossard, Nicolai 'I I JJMC, Kallosh, Roiban 'I I Chemissany, Kallosh, Ortin 'I 2 Broedel, JJMC, Ferrara, Kallosh, Roiban 'I 2



similarities and differences between N=4 SG and N=8 SG

possibility of matter-couplings

existence of anomalies

goal: convince you calculation of amplitudes can help clarify

Gluons for (almost) nothing and gravitons for free!

motivate calculating with color-kinematics & double copy

(see also talks by Tristan and Henrik)



Integral	$\mathcal{N} = 4$ Yang-Mills	$\mathcal{N} = 8$ Supergravity
(a)-(d)	s^2	$[s^2]^2$
(e)-(g)	$s(l_1 + k_4)^2$	$[s(l_1 + k_4)^2]^2$
(h)	$\begin{array}{l} s(l_1+l_2)^2+t(l_3+l_4)^2\\ -sl_5^2-tl_6^2-st \end{array}$	$ \begin{aligned} & (s(l_1+l_2)^2+t(l_3+l_4)^2-st)^2-s^2(2((l_1+l_2)^2-t)+l_5^2)l_5^2 \\ & -t^2(2((l_3+l_4)^2-s)+l_6^2)l_6^2-s^2(2l_7^2l_2^2+2l_1^2l_9^2+l_2^2l_9^2+l_1^2l_7^2) \\ & -t^2(2l_3^2l_8^2+2l_{10}^2l_4^2+l_8^2l_4^2+l_3^2l_{10}^2)+2stl_5^2l_6^2 \end{aligned} $
(i)	$s(l_1 + l_2)^2 - t(l_3 + l_4)^2 - \frac{1}{3}(s - t)l_5^2$	$\frac{(s(l_1+l_2)^2 - t(l_3+l_4)^2)^2}{-(s^2(l_1+l_2)^2 + t^2(l_3+l_4)^2 + \frac{1}{3}stu)l_5^2}$



Integral	$\mathcal{N} = 4$ Yang-Mills	$\mathcal{N} = 8$ Supergravity
(a)-(d)	s^2	$[s^2]^2$
(e)-(g)	$s(l_1 + k_4)^2$	$[s(l_1 + k_4)^2]^2$
(h)	$\frac{s(l_1+l_2)^2+t(l_3+l_4)^2}{-sl_5^2-tl_6^2-st}$	$ \begin{aligned} &(s(l_1+l_2)^2+t(l_3+l_4)^2-st)^2-s^2(2((l_1+l_2)^2-t)+l_5^2)l_5^2\\ &-t^2(2((l_3+l_4)^2-s)+l_6^2)l_6^2-s^2(2l_7^2l_2^2+2l_1^2l_9^2+l_2^2l_9^2+l_1^2l_7^2)\\ &-t^2(2l_3^2l_8^2+2l_{10}^2l_4^2+l_8^2l_4^2+l_3^2l_{10}^2)+2stl_5^2l_6^2 \end{aligned} $
(i)	$s(l_1 + l_2)^2 - t(l_3 + l_4)^2 - \frac{1}{3}(s - t)l_5^2$	$\frac{(s(l_1+l_2)^2 - t(l_3+l_4)^2)^2}{-(s^2(l_1+l_2)^2 + t^2(l_3+l_4)^2 + \frac{1}{3}stu)l_5^2}$



Integral	$\mathcal{N} = 4$ Yang-Mills	$\mathcal{N} = 8$ Supergravity
(a)-(d)	s^2	$[s^2]^2$
(e)-(g)	$s(l_1 + k_4)^2$	$[s(l_1+k_4)^2]^2$
(h)	$\begin{array}{l} s(l_1+l_2)^2+t(l_3+l_4)^2\\ -sl_5^2-tl_6^2-st \end{array}$	$ \begin{aligned} &(s(l_1+l_2)^2+t(l_3+l_4)^2-st)^2-s^2(2((l_1+l_2)^2-t)+l_5^2)l_5^2\\ &-t^2(2((l_3+l_4)^2-s)+l_6^2)l_6^2-s^2(2l_7^2l_2^2+2l_1^2l_9^2+l_2^2l_9^2+l_1^2l_7^2)\\ &-t^2(2l_3^2l_8^2+2l_{10}^2l_4^2+l_8^2l_4^2+l_3^2l_{10}^2)+2stl_5^2l_6^2 \end{aligned} $
(i)	$s(l_1 + l_2)^2 - t(l_3 + l_4)^2 - \frac{1}{3}(s - t)l_5^2$	$\frac{(s(l_1+l_2)^2 - t(l_3+l_4)^2)^2}{-(s^2(l_1+l_2)^2 + t^2(l_3+l_4)^2 + \frac{1}{3}stu)l_5^2}$



Integral	$\mathcal{N} = 4$ Yang-Mills	$\mathcal{N} = 8$ Supergravity
(a)-(d)	s^2	$[s^2]^2$
(e)-(g)	$s(l_1 + k_4)^2$	$[s(l_1 + k_4)^2]^2$
(h)	$\frac{s(l_1+l_2)^2+t(l_3+l_4)^2}{-sl_5^2-tl_6^2-st}$	$\frac{(s(l_1+l_2)^2+t(l_3+l_4)^2-st)^2-s^2(2((l_1+l_2)^2-t)+l_5^2)l_5^2}{-t^2(2((l_3+l_4)^2-s)+l_6^2)l_6^2-s^2(2l_7^2l_2^2+2l_1^2l_9^2+l_2^2l_9^2+l_1^2l_7^2)}{-t^2(2l_3^2l_8^2+2l_{10}^2l_4^2+l_8^2l_4^2+l_3^2l_{10}^2)+2stl_5^2l_6^2}$
(i)	$\frac{s(l_1+l_2)^2-t(l_3+l_4)^2}{-\frac{1}{3}(s-t)l_5^2}$	$- (s^2 \frac{(s(l_1+l_2)^2 - t(l_3+l_4)^2)^2}{(l_1+l_2)^2 + t^2(l_3+l_4)^2 + \frac{1}{3}stu)l_5^2}$

BCJ '08, '10







"DECODING THE DNA OF GRAVITY"

$\frac{(-i)^{L}}{g^{n-2+2L}}\mathcal{A}^{\text{loop}} = \sum_{\mathcal{G}\in\text{cubic}}\int\prod_{l=1}^{L}\frac{d^{D}p_{l}}{(2\pi)^{D}}\frac{1}{S(\mathcal{G})}\frac{n(\mathcal{G})c(\mathcal{G})}{D(\mathcal{G})}$

BCJ '08, '10

LOOP LEVEL DOUBLE COPY

"DECODING THE DNA OF GRAVITY"

$\frac{(-i)^{L}}{g^{n-2+2L}}\mathcal{A}^{\text{loop}} = \sum_{\mathcal{G}\in\text{cubic}}\int\prod_{l=1}^{L}\frac{d^{D}p_{l}}{(2\pi)^{D}}\frac{1}{S(\mathcal{G})}\frac{n(\mathcal{G})c(\mathcal{G})}{D(\mathcal{G})}$

BCJ '08, '10

LOOP LEVEL DOUBLE COPY

$\frac{(-i)^{L+1}}{(\kappa/2)^{n-2+2L}}\mathcal{M}^{\text{loop}} = \sum_{\mathcal{G}\in\text{cubic}}\int\prod_{l=1}^{L}\frac{d^{D}p_{l}}{(2\pi)^{D}}\frac{1}{S(\mathcal{G})}\frac{n(\mathcal{G})\tilde{n}(\mathcal{G})}{D(\mathcal{G})}$

BCJ (2010)



Only need maximal cut information of (e) graph to build full amplitude!

Integral $I^{(x)}$	$\mathcal{N} = 4$ Super-Yang-Mills ($\sqrt{\mathcal{N} = 8}$ supergravity) numerator
(a)-(d)	s^2
(e)-(g)	$(s(-\tau_{35}+\tau_{45}+t)-t(\tau_{25}+\tau_{45})+u(\tau_{25}+\tau_{35})-s^2)/3$
(h)	$ \left(s \left(2\tau_{15} - \tau_{16} + 2\tau_{26} - \tau_{27} + 2\tau_{35} + \tau_{36} + \tau_{37} - u \right) \\ + t \left(\tau_{16} + \tau_{26} - \tau_{37} + 2\tau_{36} - 2\tau_{15} - 2\tau_{27} - 2\tau_{35} - 3\tau_{17} \right) + s^2 \right) / 3 $
(i)	$ig(s\left(- au_{25}- au_{26}- au_{35}+ au_{36}+ au_{45}+2t ig) \ +t\left(au_{26}+ au_{35}+2 au_{36}+2 au_{45}+3 au_{46} ight)+u au_{25}+s^2ig)/3$
(j)-(l)	s(t-u)/3

Aside: on cuts

(where do we get our data?)

TEXTBOOK APPROACH



TEXTBOOK APPROACH



Simple graph rules for constructing scattering amplitudes

JUST THE GRAVITON....



BUT FINAL EXPRESSIONS ARE TRACTABLE

~**10**³¹

TERMS

MOST SYMMETRIC 4D THEORY, N=8 SUGRA



NECESSARY & SUFFICIENT



NECESSARY & SUFFICIENT



SUFFICIENT

 $\bigvee \mathcal{U}_{\mathcal{L}} \in \textbf{unitarity cuts} \overset{\text{Bern,}}{\underset{\text{Kosov}}{\text{Bern,}}}$

Bern, Dixon, Dunbar, and Kosower ('94,'95)

Bern, Dixon, and Kosower ('96)

Britto, Cachazo, and Feng ('04)

TREE-LEVEL CUT

- • • •]

 \mathcal{A}







Don't be!



4D state-sums completely under control for N <= 4 sYM



Bern, JJMC, Ita, Johansson, Roiban '09

N=4 sYM



(state sums follow the gluons)

 $\mathcal{S}_{\mathcal{N}=4} = (A+B+C+\dots)^4 \longrightarrow$ $\mathcal{S}_{\mathcal{N}<4} = (A+B+C+\dots)^{\mathcal{N}} (A^{4-\mathcal{N}}+B^{4-\mathcal{N}}+C^{4-\mathcal{N}}+\dots)$

Bern, JJMC, Ita, Johansson, Roiban '09



Higher dimensional cuts also important!



Workhorse: N=1 in 10D

(as tree multiplicity increases expressions can be unwieldy)

Also very useful: N=2 in 6D

Cheung, O'Connell; Dennen, Huang, Siegel; Boels; Bern, JJMC, Dennen, Huang, Ita

Best: Recycling known D-dimensional amplitudes

EVERYONE



Back to Color-Kinematics / Double-copy



How does color-kinematics help us with less SUSY?



Look at N=4 Super Yang-Mills 4-pt1-loop



Green, Schwarz, Brink

 $\alpha = 1$

How does color-kinematics help us with less SUSY?



Symmetric

Green, Schwarz, Brink

Numerator ansatz by powercounting? a constant: $\alpha = 1$







Asymmetric

but problem! local gauge-inv. numerators don't work

JJMC, Chiodaroli, Gunaydin, Roiban '12



Asymmetric

but problem! local gauge-inv. numerators don't work

Lessons from N=4 5-pt multiloop, and symmetric tree through 6-pt: <u>divide by [Gram Det]^k</u> <u>Broedel, JJMC</u>

JJMC, Chiodaroli, Gunaydin, Roiban '12



Asymmetric gauge invariant numerators, requires non-locality in ext legs Parity odd components!

Numerator ansatz for $\mathcal{N} \geq 1~\mathrm{SYM}$

$$N(g) = \frac{1}{(stu)^2} \Big(P_{g;(6,2)}(\tau_{l,k_1}, \tau_{l,k_2}, \tau_{l,k_3}; s, t) \Big)$$

+ $4i\varepsilon(k_1, k_2, k_3, l) P_{g;(4,0)}(\tau_{l,k_1}, \tau_{l,k_2}, \tau_{l,k_3}; s, t)$

JJMC, Chiodaroli, Gunaydin, Roiban '12

Universal structure for $\mathcal{N}>1~\mathrm{SYM}$



Universal structure for $\mathcal{N}>1~\mathrm{SYM}$



Universal structure for factorizable $\mathcal{N} \geq 1~\mathrm{SG}$



$$\mathcal{M}_{4,\mathcal{N}=1\times\mathcal{N}=1}^{(1)} = \mathcal{M}_{4,\mathcal{N}=8}^{(1)} + i\left(\frac{\kappa}{2}\right)^4 M_{\text{tree}} \left[6\frac{tu}{s^2} (s^2 - \frac{3(1+f)}{4}tu) I_4^{D=6-2\epsilon}(t,u) + \frac{9}{4} (1+f)\frac{tu}{s^2} (t-u) (I_2(u) - I_2(t)) + \frac{9}{2} \frac{1+(3-D)f}{D-2} (I_2(u) + I_2(t)) \right]_{f\to 1}^{I=6-2\epsilon}$$

$$\mathcal{M}_{4,\mathcal{N}=2\times\mathcal{N}=1}^{(1)} = \mathcal{M}_{4,\mathcal{N}=8}^{(1)} + i\left(\frac{\kappa}{2}\right)^4 M_{\text{tree}} \left[\frac{tu}{s^2}(5s^2 - 3(1+f)tu) I_4^{D=6-2\epsilon}(t,u) + \frac{3}{2}(1+f)\frac{tu}{s^2}(t-u)(I_2(u) - I_2(t)) + 3\frac{1+(3-D)f}{D-2}(I_2(u) + I_2(t))\right]_{f\to 1}^{I=6-2\epsilon}$$

Many interesting lessons from this:

Solution
 In the second structure in gauge and gravity amplitudes

Four-graviton amplitudes are insensitive to the precise nature of the matter couplings

• \geq everywhere we look two different presentations of N=4 SG are the same

 just because something integrates to zero for gauge theories doesn't mean we can ignore it in doublecopying to gravity



difference structurally between N>4 SG and N=4 SG



N=4 SG first time double copied from N=0YM

something new with N=0YM YES! amplitudes?



This means something new at N=4 SG







New stuff in N=4 SG



Is there a way to line this up and identify / clarify known U(I) anomaly in N=4 SG?



New stuff in N=4 SG



Is there a way to line this up and identify / clarify known U(1) anomaly in N=4 SG?

YES





$N=8: SU(8) \supset SU(4) \times SU(4) \times U(1) .$

$$1 = (1, 1)^{0}$$

$${f 8} \;\;=\;\; ({f 4},{f 1})^q \oplus ({f 1},{f 4})^{-q}$$

- $\mathbf{28} \;\; = \;\; (\mathbf{6},\mathbf{1})^{2q} \oplus (\mathbf{1},\mathbf{6})^{-2q} \oplus (\mathbf{4},\mathbf{4})^{0}$
- ${f 56} \ = \ (ar{4}, {f 1})^{3q} \oplus ({f 1}, ar{4})^{-3q} \oplus ({f 6}, {f 4})^q \oplus ({f 4}, {f 6})^{-q}$
- ${f 70} \ = \ ({f 1},{f 1})^{4q} \oplus ({f 1},{f 1})^{-4q} \oplus ({f ar 4},{f 4})^{2q} \oplus ({f 4},{f ar 4})^{-2q} \oplus ({f 6},{f 6})^0 \ .$



$N=8: SU(8) \supset SU(4) \times SU(4) \times U(1) .$

$$1 = (1, 1)^0$$

$${f 8} \;\;=\;\; ({f 4},{f 1})^q \oplus ({f 1},{f 4})^{-q}$$

- $\mathbf{28} \;\; = \;\; (\mathbf{6},\mathbf{1})^{2q} \oplus (\mathbf{1},\mathbf{6})^{-2q} \oplus (\mathbf{4},\mathbf{4})^{0}$
- ${f 56} \ = \ (ar{4}, {f 1})^{3q} \oplus ({f 1}, ar{4})^{-3q} \oplus ({f 6}, {f 4})^q \oplus ({f 4}, {f 6})^{-q}$
- ${f 70} \;\;=\;\; ({f 1},{f 1})^{4q} \oplus ({f 1},{f 1})^{-4q} \oplus ({f ar 4},{f 4})^{2q} \oplus ({f 4},{f ar 4})^{-2q} \oplus ({f 6},{f 6})^0 \;.$

N=4 SG mult.



N=8: $SU(8) \supset SU(4) \times SU(4) \times U(1)$.

- $1 = (1,1)^{0}$ $8 = (4,1)^{q} \oplus (1,4)^{-q}$ U(I) identified w/ U(I)symmetry of N=4 SG
- $\mathbf{28} = (\mathbf{6}, \mathbf{1})^{2q} \oplus (\mathbf{1}, \mathbf{6})^{-2q} \oplus (\mathbf{4}, \mathbf{4})^{0}$
- ${f 56} \;\;=\;\; (ar{4},{f 1})^{3q} \oplus ({f 1},ar{4})^{-3q} \oplus ({f 6},{f 4})^q \oplus ({f 4},{f 6})^{-q}$
- ${f 70} \;\;=\;\; ({f 1},{f 1})^{4q} \oplus ({f 1},{f 1})^{-4q} \oplus ({f ar 4},{f 4})^{2q} \oplus ({f 4},{f ar 4})^{-2q} \oplus ({f 6},{f 6})^0 \;.$

N=4 SG mult.

Correct choice of charge q under U(I) leads to anomalous part of effective action

$$\Gamma_{\rm an}^{\mathcal{N}=4,n_{\rm v}} = \frac{1}{2} (2+n_{\rm v}) \Gamma_{\rm an}^{\mathcal{N}=4,n_{\rm v}=0} = \frac{2+n_{\rm v}}{4(4\pi)^2} \int R R^* \nabla^{-2} \nabla_{\mu} a^{\mu}$$

Amplitude considerations reproduces this exactly (n_v corresponding to including n_v scalars in N=0YM)

Preview (anomalous amplitudes):

$$\mathcal{M}_{3}^{(1);\mathcal{N}=4}(1,2,3) = \frac{i}{(4\pi)^{2}} \left(\frac{\kappa}{2}\right)^{3} \delta^{(8)} \left(\sum_{i=1}^{3} \tilde{\eta}_{i}^{A} \tilde{\lambda}_{i}\right) + + + + \mathcal{M}_{4}^{(1);\mathcal{N}=4}(1,2,3,4) = \frac{i}{(4\pi)^{2}} \left(\frac{\kappa}{2}\right)^{4} \delta^{(8)} \left(\sum_{i=1}^{4} \tilde{\eta}_{i}^{A} \tilde{\lambda}_{i}\right)$$

$$\mathcal{M}_{5}^{(1);\mathcal{N}=4}(1,2,3,4,5) = \frac{2i}{(4\pi)^{2}} \left(\frac{\kappa}{2}\right)^{5} \delta^{(8)} \left(\sum_{i=1}^{5} \tilde{\eta}_{i}^{A} \tilde{\lambda}_{i}\right)$$

related by soft-limits

$$\mathcal{M}_n^{(L)}(1,2,\ldots n-1,n) \stackrel{k_n \to 0}{\longrightarrow} \frac{\kappa}{2} \mathcal{S}_n^{(0)} \mathcal{M}_{n-1}^{(L)}(1,2,\ldots n-1)$$

...more very soon....

JJMC, Kallosh, Roiban, Tseytlin

╋

╋



2001 BIK derives nice recursive formula for N=2 "Born-Infeld" action gives to order W^10 open question if this last term satisfied duality...

$S_{\rm BI} = S_{\rm free} + S_{\rm int,10}$

$$\begin{split} \mathcal{S}_{\mathrm{int},10} &= \int \mathrm{d}^{12} \mathcal{Z} \Biggl\{ \frac{1}{8} \mathcal{W}^2 \overline{\mathcal{W}}^2 \lambda + \lambda^2 \left(\frac{1}{72} \mathcal{W}^3 \Box \left[\overline{\mathcal{W}}^3 \right] + \frac{1}{16} \mathcal{W}^2 \overline{\mathcal{W}}^2 \mathcal{D}^4 \left[\mathcal{W}^2 \right] + \frac{1}{16} \mathcal{W}^2 \overline{\mathcal{W}}^2 \overline{\mathcal{D}}^4 \left[\overline{\mathcal{W}}^2 \right] \right) \\ &+ \lambda^3 \left(\frac{\mathcal{W}^4 \Box \left[\Box \left[\overline{\mathcal{W}}^4 \right] \right]}{1152} + \frac{1}{48} \mathcal{W}^3 \Box \left[\overline{\mathcal{W}}^3 \mathcal{D}^4 \left[\mathcal{W}^2 \right] \right] + \frac{1}{48} \overline{\mathcal{W}}^3 \Box \left[\mathcal{W}^3 \overline{\mathcal{D}}^4 \left[\overline{\mathcal{W}}^2 \right] \right] + \frac{1}{32} \mathcal{W}^2 \overline{\mathcal{W}}^2 \mathcal{D}^4 \left[\mathcal{W}^2 \right]^2 \\ &+ \frac{3}{32} \mathcal{W}^2 \overline{\mathcal{W}}^2 \mathcal{D}^4 \left[\mathcal{W}^2 \right] \overline{\mathcal{D}}^1 \left[\overline{\mathcal{W}}^2 \right] + \frac{1}{32} \mathcal{W}^2 \overline{\mathcal{W}}^2 \overline{\mathcal{D}}^4 \left[\overline{\mathcal{W}}^2 \right]^2 \right) \\ &+ \lambda^4 \left(- \frac{\mathcal{W}^5 \Box \left[\Box \left[\Box \left[\overline{\mathcal{W}}^5 \right] \right] \right]}{28800} + \frac{1}{576} \overline{\mathcal{W}}^4 \Box \left[\Box \left[\mathcal{W}^4 \overline{\mathcal{D}}^4 \left[\overline{\mathcal{W}}^2 \right] \right] \right] + \frac{1}{576} \Box \left[\mathcal{W}^4 \right] \Box \left[\overline{\mathcal{W}}^4 \mathcal{D}^4 \left[\mathcal{W}^2 \right] \right] + \frac{1}{48} \mathcal{W}^3 \Box \left[\overline{\mathcal{W}}^3 \mathcal{D}^4 \left[\mathcal{W}^2 \right]^2 \right] \\ &+ \frac{1}{48} \overline{\mathcal{W}}^3 \Box \left[\mathcal{W}^3 \overline{\mathcal{D}}^4 \left[\overline{\mathcal{W}}^2 \right]^2 \right] + \frac{1}{36} \overline{\mathcal{W}}^3 \Box \left[\mathcal{W}^3 \overline{\mathcal{D}}^4 \left[\overline{\mathcal{W}}^2 \right] \right] \mathcal{D}^1 \left[\mathcal{W}^2 \right] + \frac{1}{64} \mathcal{W}^2 \overline{\mathcal{W}}^2 \mathcal{D}^1 \left[\mathcal{W}^2 \right]^3 + \frac{1}{576} \overline{\mathcal{W}}^4 \Box \left[\mathcal{W}^3 \right] \mathcal{D}^4 \left[\Box \left[\mathcal{W}^3 \right] \right] \\ &+ \frac{1}{16} \mathcal{W}^2 \overline{\mathcal{W}}^2 \mathcal{D}^4 \left[\mathcal{W}^2 \right]^2 \overline{\mathcal{D}}^1 \left[\overline{\mathcal{W}}^2 \right] + \frac{1}{32} \mathcal{W}^2 \overline{\mathcal{W}}^2 \mathcal{D}^4 \left[\mathcal{W}^2 \right] \overline{\mathcal{D}}^4 \left[\mathcal{W}^2 \right] \overline{\mathcal{D}}^1 \left[\overline{\mathcal{W}}^2 \right] \\ &+ \frac{1}{64} \mathcal{W}^2 \overline{\mathcal{W}}^2 \overline{\mathcal{D}}^4 \left[\overline{\mathcal{W}}^2 \right]^3 + \frac{1}{576} \mathcal{W}^4 \Box \left[\overline{\mathcal{W}}^3 \right] \overline{\mathcal{D}}^4 \left[\Box \left[\overline{\mathcal{W}}^3 \right] \right] \\ &+ \frac{1}{64} \mathcal{W}^2 \overline{\mathcal{W}}^2 \overline{\mathcal{D}}^4 \left[\overline{\mathcal{W}}^2 \right]^3 + \frac{1}{576} \mathcal{W}^4 \Box \left[\overline{\mathcal{W}}^3 \right] \overline{\mathcal{D}}^4 \left[\Box \left[\overline{\mathcal{W}}^3 \right] \right] \\ &+ \frac{1}{64} \mathcal{W}^2 \overline{\mathcal{W}}^2 \overline{\mathcal{D}}^4 \left[\overline{\mathcal{W}}^2 \right]^3 + \frac{1}{576} \mathcal{W}^4 \Box \left[\overline{\mathcal{W}}^3 \right] \overline{\mathcal{D}}^4 \left[\Box \left[\overline{\mathcal{W}}^3 \right] \right] \\ &+ \frac{1}{22} \mathcal{W}^2 \overline{\mathcal{W}}^2 \mathcal{D}^4 \left[\mathcal{W}^2 \right] \overline{\mathcal{D}}^4 \left[\mathcal{W}^2 \right] \right] \right) \right\}$$
(1.2)

$S_{\rm BI} = S_{\rm free} + S_{\rm int,10}$

$$\begin{split} \mathcal{S}_{\mathrm{int},10} &= \int \mathrm{d}^{12} \mathcal{Z} \Biggl\{ \frac{1}{8} \mathcal{W}^2 \overline{\mathcal{W}}^2 \lambda + \lambda^2 \left(\frac{1}{72} \mathcal{W}^3 \Box \left[\overline{\mathcal{W}}^3 \right] + \frac{1}{16} \mathcal{W}^2 \overline{\mathcal{W}}^2 \mathcal{D}^4 \left[\mathcal{W}^2 \right] + \frac{1}{16} \mathcal{W}^2 \overline{\mathcal{W}}^2 \overline{\mathcal{D}}^4 \left[\overline{\mathcal{W}}^2 \right] \right) \\ &+ \lambda^3 \left(\frac{\mathcal{W}^4 \Box \left[\Box \left[\overline{\mathcal{W}}^4 \right] \right]}{1152} + \frac{1}{48} \mathcal{W}^3 \Box \left[\overline{\mathcal{W}}^3 \mathcal{D}^4 \left[\mathcal{W}^2 \right] \right] + \frac{1}{48} \overline{\mathcal{W}}^3 \Box \left[\mathcal{W}^3 \overline{\mathcal{D}}^4 \left[\overline{\mathcal{W}}^2 \right] \right] + \frac{1}{32} \mathcal{W}^2 \overline{\mathcal{W}}^2 \mathcal{D}^4 \left[\mathcal{W}^2 \right]^2 \\ &+ \frac{3}{32} \mathcal{W}^2 \overline{\mathcal{W}}^2 \mathcal{D}^4 \left[\mathcal{W}^2 \right] \overline{\mathcal{D}}^4 \left[\overline{\mathcal{W}}^2 \right] + \frac{1}{32} \mathcal{W}^2 \overline{\mathcal{W}}^2 \overline{\mathcal{D}}^4 \left[\overline{\mathcal{W}}^2 \right]^2 \right) \\ &+ \lambda^4 \left(- \frac{\mathcal{W}^5 \Box \left[\Box \left[\Box \left[\overline{\mathcal{W}}^5 \right] \right] \right]}{28800} + \frac{1}{576} \overline{\mathcal{W}}^4 \Box \left[\Box \left[\mathcal{W}^4 \overline{\mathcal{D}}^4 \left[\overline{\mathcal{W}}^2 \right] \right] \right] + \frac{1}{576} \Box \left[\mathcal{W}^4 \right] \Box \left[\overline{\mathcal{W}}^4 \mathcal{D}^4 \left[\mathcal{W}^2 \right] \right] + \frac{1}{48} \mathcal{W}^3 \Box \left[\overline{\mathcal{W}}^3 \mathcal{D}^4 \left[\mathcal{W}^2 \right]^2 \right] \\ &+ \frac{1}{48} \overline{\mathcal{W}^3} \Box \left[\mathcal{W}^3 \overline{\mathcal{D}}^4 \left[\overline{\mathcal{W}}^2 \right]^2 \right] + \frac{1}{36} \overline{\mathcal{W}}^3 \Box \left[\mathcal{W}^3 \overline{\mathcal{D}}^4 \left[\overline{\mathcal{W}}^2 \right] \right] \mathcal{D}^4 \left[\mathcal{W}^2 \right] + \frac{1}{64} \mathcal{W}^2 \overline{\mathcal{W}}^2 \mathcal{D}^4 \left[\mathcal{W}^2 \right]^3 + \frac{1}{576} \overline{\mathcal{W}}^4 \Box \left[\mathcal{W}^3 \right] \mathcal{D}^4 \left[\Box \left[\mathcal{W}^3 \right] \right] \\ &+ \frac{1}{16} \mathcal{W}^2 \overline{\mathcal{W}}^2 \mathcal{D}^4 \left[\mathcal{W}^2 \right]^2 \overline{\mathcal{D}}^4 \left[\overline{\mathcal{W}}^2 \right] + \frac{1}{32} \mathcal{W}^2 \overline{\mathcal{W}}^2 \mathcal{D}^4 \left[\overline{\mathcal{W}}^2 \right] \right] \overline{\mathcal{D}}^4 \left[\overline{\mathcal{W}}^2 \right] \right] \overline{\mathcal{D}}^4 \left[\overline{\mathcal{W}}^2 \right] \mathcal{D}^4 \left[\mathcal{W}^2 \overline{\mathcal{D}}^4 \left[\mathcal{W}^2 \right] \right] \right) \Biggr\}$$
(1.2)

Broedel, JJMC, Ferrara, Kallosh, Roiban '12

duality satisfied if

$$\int d^8 \mathcal{Z} \left(\mathcal{W}^2 + \mathcal{M}^2 \right) - \int d^8 \overline{\mathcal{Z}} \left(\overline{\mathcal{W}}^2 + \overline{\mathcal{M}}^2 \right) = 0$$

$$\mathrm{i}\,\mathcal{M} \equiv 4\,\frac{\mathrm{d}}{\mathrm{d}\mathcal{W}}\,\mathcal{S}[\mathcal{W},\overline{\mathcal{W}}].$$

$$0 = \frac{1}{3}I_2 + \frac{1}{36}I_{3a} + \frac{1}{2}I_{3b} + 2I_{3c} + \frac{1}{720}I_{4a} + \frac{1}{12}I_{4b} + \frac{1}{12}I_{4c} + \frac{1}{6}I_{4d} + \frac{1}{6}I_{4e} + \frac{1}{18}I_{4f} + \frac{1}{18}I_{4g} + \frac{1}{18}I_{4h} + \frac{1}{2}I_{4i} + \frac{1}{2}I_{4j}$$

somewhat tedious, but straightforward integration by parts identities shows all terms vanishes....

$$I_{4i} = \lambda^{4} \int d^{12} \mathcal{Z} \left(+7\mathcal{W}^{2} \overline{\mathcal{W}}^{2} \mathcal{D}^{4} \left[\mathcal{W}^{2} \right]^{2} \overline{\mathcal{D}}^{4} \left[\overline{\mathcal{W}}^{2} \right] - 4\mathcal{W}^{2} \overline{\mathcal{W}}^{2} \mathcal{D}^{4} \left[\mathcal{W}^{2} \right] \mathcal{D}^{4} \left[\mathcal{W}^{2} \overline{\mathcal{D}}^{4} \left[\overline{\mathcal{W}}^{2} \right] \right]$$
$$+ 3\mathcal{W}^{2} \overline{\mathcal{W}}^{2} \mathcal{D}^{4} \left[\mathcal{W}^{2} \overline{\mathcal{D}}^{4} \left[\mathcal{W}^{2} \right] \right] - 3\mathcal{W}^{2} \overline{\mathcal{W}}^{2} \mathcal{D}^{4} \left[\mathcal{W}^{2} \right] \overline{\mathcal{D}}^{4} \left[\overline{\mathcal{W}}^{2} \mathcal{D}^{4} \left[\mathcal{W}^{2} \right] \right]$$
$$- 3\mathcal{W}^{2} \overline{\mathcal{W}}^{2} \overline{\mathcal{D}}^{4} \left[\overline{\mathcal{W}}^{2} \mathcal{D}^{4} \left[\mathcal{W}^{2} \right]^{2} \right] \right)$$

+ 13 others

exists much more satisfying constructive proof...



DUALITY

find duality-conserving sources of deformation...

through W^8

$$\mathcal{I}(T^-,\overline{T}^+) = \int d^{12} \mathcal{Z} \left(\lambda \ a_0 \ (T^-)^2 (\overline{T}^+)^2 \right)^2$$

$$+ \lambda^2 \ a_1 \ (T^-)^3 \Box (\overline{T}^+)^3 + \lambda^3 \ a_2 (T^-)^4 \Box^2 (\overline{T}^+)^4$$

$$+ \lambda^3 \ a_3 \ (T^-)^2 (\overline{T}^+)^2 \overline{\mathcal{D}}^4 ((T^-)^2) \mathcal{D}^4 ((\overline{T}^+)^2)$$

$$+ \mathcal{O}(\lambda^4) \right)$$
Broedel, JJMC, Ferrara, Kallosh, Roiban '12

$$\mathcal{I}_{\lambda^4}(T^-,\overline{T}^+) = \lambda^4 \int \mathrm{d}^{12}\mathcal{Z}\left(a_4 \ (T^-)^5 \Box^3 (\overline{T}^+)^5\right)$$

+ $a_5 (T^-)^3 \mathcal{D}^4 ((\overline{T}^+)^2) \Box (\overline{T}^+)^3 \overline{\mathcal{D}}^4 ((T^-)^2) \int_{\text{JJMC, Kallosh 'I3}}$

ASK THE RIGHT QUESTIONS



when in doubt, calculate

beauty that trivializes calculations is very special