Pentaquark: Fact or Fancy

Patrizia Rossi Laboratori Nazionali di Frascati - INFN





- •Introduction
- •Experimental Overview
- •Comments on positive and null results
- •Dedicated Experimental Program @ JLab
- Conclusion

The CLAS collaboration has decided that results will be presented <u>only when final</u>

Normally, preliminary results would be shown, but these are not normal circumstances.

Introduction

Known HADRONS

bound states of three quarks(qqq): BARYONS quark and anti-quark(qq): MESONS

QCD: predicts the existence of mesons and baryons with more complicated internal structure.

non-conventional mesons : ggg(glueballs), qqg (hybrids),qqqq non-conventionale baryons: qqqg, qqqqq

Pentaquarks

- •Baryons whose minimum quark content is 4 quarks and 1 antiquark
- •"Exotic" pentaguarks are those where the antiguark has a different flavor than the other 4 guarks ; guantum num. cannot be defined by only 3 guarks

Ex: uudss, non-exotic	Baryon number = 1/3 + 1/3 + 1/3 + 1/3 - 1/3 = 1 Strangeness = 0 + 0 + 0 - 1 + 1 = 0
Ex: uudds, exotic	Baryon number = 1/3 + 1/3 + 1/3 + 1/3 - 1/3 = 1 Strangeness = 0 + 0 + 0 + 0 + 1 = +1

Introduction

Before 2003

There were searches in the 1960's and1970's mostly in bubble chamber experiments with incident π and K beams for what was then referred to as the Z*, a baryon with positive strangeness. Those experiments found no enhancements in S=+1 baryon channels. Indeed the failure to find such flavor exotic baryons lent credence to the then nascent quark model.

After 2003

.....Hadronic Physics has been very interesting



Spectacular Development

1987 First prediction of the mass: Mass Z⁺ (uudds^{*}) = 1530 MeV Preszalowicz, Chiral Soliton Model, World Scient. '87, p. 112

1997 First prediction of the width: Γ < 15 MeV Diakonov, Petrov, Polyakov, Chiral Soliton Model, Z. Phys. A 359(1997)305

Mass of Z⁺ (uudds^{*}) = 1530 MeV, Spin=1/2, Isospin=0, Parity +, S=+1.

The width prediction was the key for the experimental discovery of a Θ^+ candidate in 2003

2003 First observation of Z⁺ renamed Θ^+ : Mass 1540 ±10 MeV LEPS Collaboration, T Nakano et al, PRL91 (2003) 012002



Pentaquark in the Chiral Quark Soliton Model

: [10] J=1/2 exotic (N*(1710) fixes all the masses)

S = +1

S = 0

S = -1

 $\Xi^+(1862)$ S = -2

• Soliton: rigid core (q^3) surrounded by meson fiels $(q\overline{q})$

N (1650-1690)

Σ **(1760-1810)**

- Barions are rotational states of the soliton nucleon in spin-isospin space
 - 1st eccited state : [8] J=1/2 2nd " : [10] J=3/2

G<15 MeV ● ^{⊕†}(1539)

3rd

Symmetries give

an equal spacing

between "tiers"

G~140 MeV



- Definite predictions about masses & widths of the states
- Presence of three states with explicit exotic quantum numbers
- Width very narrow
 - → directly visible in measured invariant masses
 - → No complicate p.w.a.needed

Diakonov et al. - Z. Phys. A359 (1997) 305
D. Diakonov, V. Petrov, arXiv:hep-ph/0310212

Where we are now

Before 2003 searches for flavor exotic baryons came up empty but now we have claims for:



Evidence for Pentaguark States



Positive Results

LEPS	γC ₁₂ → K⁻ K⁺n	Θ+	SVD	pA → K ⁰ pX	Θ+
PRL 91(2003) 012002		K ⁺ n	hep-ex/0401024		Kº p
CLAS	γd → K⁺ K⁻np	Θ+	ITEP (v)	vA → K⁰pX	Θ+
PRL 91(2003) 252001 PRL 92(2004) 032001	γp → K⁺ K⁻nπ⁺	K⁺ n	Phys. Atom. Nucl. 67 (2004) 682		K⁰ p
SAPHIR	γp → Kº K⁺n	Θ+	JINR	$p+C_{3}H_{8} \rightarrow K^{0}pX$	Θ+
Phys. Lett. B572(2003)127		K⁺ n	hep-ex/0403044 hep-ex/0404003 hep-ex/0410016	np →n pK⁺K⁻	K⁰ p
DIANA	K⁺ Xe → K⁰ pXe'	Θ+	NOMAD	vC → K⁰pX	Θ+
Phys. Atom. Nucl. 66 (2003) 1715		K ⁰ p	Talk@neutrino 2004 Conference		K⁰ p
HERMES	γ*d → K⁰pX	Θ+	NA49	pp → Ξ π X	Ξ_5
Phys. Lett. B585(2004)213		К ⁰ р	PRL 92(2004) 042003		
ZEUS	ep → PX	Θ+	H1	ep → PX	Θ
Phys. Lett. B591(2004)7		К ⁰ р	Phys. Lett. B588(2004)17		-
COSY	$pp \rightarrow K^0 p\Sigma^+$	Θ+	STAR		$N_5 \Xi_{5}^{0}$
Phys. Lett. B595(2004)127		K ⁰ p	hep-ex/0406032		
			GRAAL Talk@penta2004 Conf		N ₅

Q: Mass & Width



Mass

Ranges from ≈1520 to ≈1555 MeV/c World average: 1532.2 ± 1.3 MeV/c
Systematic shift in the ϑ⁺ mass for the 2 decay modes: nK+ and pK⁰

Width

•FWHM ranges from ≈10 to ≈25 MeV/c dominated by experimental resolution

•Most measurements are only upper limits

•Arndt et al. and Cahn et al. analysis of KN phase shifts suggests that $\Gamma < 1 \text{ MeV }!!$



Negative Results

CDF hep-ex/0408025 hep-ex/0410024	ppbar → PX Θ	Θ^+ c Ξ_5	ALEPH Phys. Lett. B599(2004)1	Hadronic Z decays Θ^+ $\Theta_c \Xi_5$
HyperCP PRD 70 (2004) 111101	(π⁺,K⁺,p)Cu → PX	Θ+	DELPHI hep-ex/0410080	Hadronic Z decays Θ^+
SELEX Quark Confinement 2004	$(\pi, p, \Sigma)p \rightarrow PX$	Θ+	L3 hep-ex/0410080	γγ→ ΘΘbar
FOCUS hep-ex/0412021	γp → PX Θ _c	Θ^+ Ξ_5	WA89 PRC 70 (2004) 022201	Σ ⁻ N→PX Ξ ₅
E690 Quark Confinement 2004	pp → PX	Θ ⁺ Ξ ₅	ZEUS hep-ex/0410029/0412005 hep-ex/0412014	ep → PX $Θ_c Ξ_5$
BES PRD 70 (2004) 012004	e⁺e⁻ → J/ψ(ψ(2S))	Θ+	HERA-B PRL 93(2003) 212003	$pA \rightarrow PX \qquad \Theta^{+} \\ \Xi_{5}$
BELLE hep-ex/0411005	KN → PX ⊖	Θ ⁺ c	SPHINX Eur. Phys. J. A21(2004) 455	$pC(N) \rightarrow \Theta KC(N) \Theta^{+}$
BaBar hep-ex/0408064	e ⁺ e ⁻ → Υ(4S)	Θ ⁺ Ξ ₅	PHENIX nuc-ex/0404001	AuAu → PX

Comments on positive and null results

There are valid criticisms for both positive and null experimental results

Critical View on Positive Experiments

- □For most of the experiments, the background shape is not clearly known
- Some experiments have harsh cuts that could affect
- the spectra unexpectedly
- or specific reaction mechanism are assumed
- cuts are necessary to lower the background
- □Kinematic Reflections?
- Almost all experiments have less than 100 signal events (except ZEUS)

Background

Background due to the non-resonant K^+K^- production in the region above 1.59 GeV fitted by a distribution of events from LH_2 target and scaled by a factor 0.2





Monte Carlo calculation •three (pK⁺K⁻) and four-body (pK⁺K⁻n) phase-space photoproduction •full simulation of detector response •BKG spectrum fitted to the data

Using Monte Carlo calculation: $\sigma=4.8$ Using different fitting functions: $\sigma=4.6\div5.8$

Background



FRITIOF (hadron-hadron, hadron-nucleus interactions generator) fails to reproduce the real background shape. This may be caused by the bunch of Σ^{*+} bumps which have rather high branching ratio for pK⁰ decays.

Distribution fitted by Gaussian function and a fourth-order polynomial background.

Background

Monte Carlo calculation:

- non-resonant contribution from PYTHIA code
- six S^{+*} broad resonances decaying into K⁰p
- one narrow resonance
 near 1.53 GeV
- Quite good description of the spectrum



CLAS - Exclusive Production on Hydrogen (I)



- Data taken in 1999 and 2000 runs
- Tagged photons 3.0 < Eg < 5.25



Further cuts are motivated by assumptions on production mechanism

CLAS - Exclusive Production on Hydrogen (II)



CLAS - Exclusive Production from Deuterium

First exclusive measurement •Data taken in 1999 run •Tagged photons with up to 3 GeV •Charged particle detected in CLAS •Neutron ID by missing mass

Possible reaction mechanism



Requires FSI both nucleons involved

DIANA



Inv mass(K⁰_sp) without cuts to reduce rescattering

$$\frac{s}{\sqrt{b}} = 2.6\sigma$$



Inv mass(K⁰_s p) with cuts to reduce rescattering

- θ_p, θ_K<100°
- cos $\Phi_{\rm pK}$ < 0 (K^{\rm O}_{\rm s} and p back to back in

the plane transverse to the beam direction)

$$\frac{s}{\sqrt{b}} = \frac{29}{\sqrt{44}} = 4.4\sigma$$

Kinematic Reflections

High mass mesons $a_2(1320), f_2(1270)$ $decaying to K^K^$ can produce structures in M(NK) at low mass(A. Dzierba et al., hepph/0311125)





Signals Statistical Significance

Experiments	Signal	Background	Published	Signif	icance	
	S	b		ξ ₁	ξ ₂	
LEPS	19	17	4.6	4.6	3.2	
DIANA	29	44	4.4	4.4	3.4	
CLAS(d)	43	54	5.2	5.9	4.4	
CLAS(p)	41	28	7.8	7.8	4.9	
SAPHIR	55	56	4.8	7.3	5.2	
COSY	60	103	4-6	5.9	4.7	
SVD	50	78	5.5	5.6	4.4	
<u>→BC</u>	-19	8	6.7	6.7	3.7	
HERMES	52	155	4.3-6.2	4.2	3.6	
ZEUS	230	1080	4.6	7.0	6.4	
NOMAD	33	59	4.3	4.3	3.4	



Results from ZEUS



Q⁺ peak is evident
 only for Q² > 20 GeV².

 →ZEUS suggests that this
 condition gives the Q⁺ enough
 transverse momentum to get into
 their detector acceptance.

2. Background

 \rightarrow MC simulation using ARIADNE gen. does not describe well data <1.6 GeV The PDG reports a Σ bump at 1480 MeV and several states above 1550 MeV. None of these are included in the simulation which includes only well established resonances Background fit with a 3-par function + 2 gaussian

Critical View on Negative Experiments

 All negative results are from high energy experiments: inclusive versus exclusive measurement -inclusive has better resolution but more background
 Production mechanisms are not generally known -sensitivity to the pentaquarks may be highly suppressed in the current fragmentation

Negative Results for Θ^+ in $e^+ e^-$

Exp	\sqrt{s} (GeV)	Reaction	Statistics	Upper Limit
BES	3.7	e⁺e⁻→ψ(2S)→ΘΘ J/ψ	14×10 ⁶ 58×10 ⁶	J/ ψ → $\Theta \Theta$ →K ⁰ pK ⁻ n + K ⁰ pK ⁺ n < 1.1 × 10 ⁻⁵ ψ (2S)→ $\Theta \Theta$ →K ⁰ pK ⁻ n + K ⁰ pK ⁺ n < 0.84 × 10 ⁻⁵ ψ (2S) - J/ ψ → single Θ pro. < ~ 10 ⁻⁵
BaBar	10.5	- e⁺e⁻→Ƴ(4S)→BB	135×10 ⁶	e⁺e⁻→qq¯→⊖ X < 5-10 x 10 ⁻⁵
ALEPH	~91	e⁺e⁻→Z⁰→qq→⊖X	4×10 ⁶	e⁺e⁻→Z ⁰ →⊖ X < 0.6 x 10 ⁻⁵

BES

PRD 70 (2004) 012004

non-observation of the pentaquark state $\Theta(1540)$ here does not mean it does not exist. It is generally believed that the dominant mechanism for charmonium ($\psi(2S)$ and J/ψ) decays is that they annihilate through three gluons. If each gluon produces one $q\bar{q}$ pair, it is natural for $\psi(2S)$ or J/ψ to decay into three $q\bar{q}$ pairs, which could form, for example, ordinary baryon-antibaryon states. For pentaquark production, five gluons are needed to produce five $q\bar{q}$ pairs. Hence its production rate in $\psi(2S)$ or J/ψ decay is expected to be small. Our result is compatible with this expectation.

Hadron Rate in e⁺e⁻



e⁺e⁻ experiments may be not sensitive to pentaquark signal



a) Low energy photoproduction experiment : baryon (target) - strange antiquark (strange component of the γ)
b) e+e- experiments
B number and S must be created from gluons How to normalize Θ⁺ production in b) with respect to a) ?
Measuring B-B and Y-Y in the same exp that does not see the Θ⁺ Tuning: measure the ratio d/p in a given experiment
d/p (H1) = 5.0±1.0±0.5 × 10⁻⁴

d/p (OPAL) = 0.8 × 10⁻⁵ (90% C.L.)

Inclusive Production (fragmentation region)



 F_0 and R_0 smooth function of x and y; keeping the dominant term the \int can be performed by an elementary method; z = 0.7 typical value for the fragm region



Theoretical Development



Conclusion on the experimental review

Θ(1540)+

PDG july 2004

It is difficult to deny a status of three stars and a place in the Summary Tables for a state that six experiments claim to have seen. Nevertheless, as discussed in the above note, we believe it reasonable to have some reservations about the existence of this state on the basis of the present evidence.

H. Lipkin hep-ph/0501209

Guidance from the wisdom of Feynman and Wigner

- 1. Feynman told us that we learned from sharpening contradictions
- 2. Wigner told us that few free parameters can fit an elephant. A few more can make him wiggle his trunk
- 3. Wigner's response to questions about a particular theory he did not like was:" I think that this theory is wrong. But the old Bohr -Sommerfield quantum theory was also wrong. Could we have reached the right theory without going through that stage?"

Goal of the Experimental 5-quark Program @ JLab

We need conclusive confirmation of the Q⁺

Experiments at low energies, with much higher statistics will settle the question

Goal of the Experimental 5-quark Program @ JLab

•High statistics search for Q

- •Solving the issues of Q^{*} (1540)
- •Search for excited states of the Q (1540)

Search for the other exotic members of the 10plet X₅⁻⁻,X₅⁺?

JLab Accelerator CEBAF



Superconducting recirculating electron accelerator

- Continuous Electron Beam
- Energy 0.8-5.7 GeV
- 200mA, polarization 75%
- Simultaneous delivery to 3Halls

Hall B

Hall B: Cebaf Large Acceptance Spectrometer + Tagger



Current Projects @ Jlab

JLab/Hall A (E-04-012)	Q⁺⁺ S ⁰ 5	ep ep	May 22 - June 1 2004	$E_e: 1.5-5.4$
JLab/Hall-B (E-03-113) G10	Q	gd	March 13-May 16 2004	E _g :0.8-3.6
JLab/Hall-B (E-04-021) G11	Q ⁺ Q ⁺ * Q ⁺⁺	gp	May 22 - July 26 2004	E _g :1.6-3.8
JLab/Hall-B (E-04-010) EG3	Ξ ₅	γd	Dec 05 2004 - January 31 2005	E _e : 5.7
JLab/Hall-B (E-04-017) SUPER-G	Ξ ₅ Q ⁺	gp	Not yet scheduled	E _g : 1.5-5.7

G10: Search for Θ^+ on Deuterium

Data taking March 13 - May 16, 2004
E_y = 0.8 - 3.59 GeV
B field = 2 settings of the torus magnet

I = 2250A : Total of 316 runs, 6015 files
Increased acceptance for forward going negative particles for inclusive (K+K-) and (K_sp) analysis
I = 3375A : Total of 300 runs, 6496 files
Similar geometrical acceptance and single track resolution as for the published data

Target = 24 cm liquid deuterium

10 billion of events collected ~ 50 pb⁻¹ (10x statistic publ. results)

G10: Search for Θ^+ on Deuterium

Data Processing Status

End of January 2005: final data processing → bos files and ntuples with 4-vectors ready for physics analysis
Physics analysis tools:

Analysis programs - mostly ready;
Development of GEANT based simulation tools are in progress.

•Independent analysis of several reactions by different groups

D	γd→nK ⁺ K ⁻ p	$\Theta^+ \rightarrow nK^+$	
Reactions	$\gamma d \rightarrow p K^0 K^-(p)$	$\Theta^+ \rightarrow pK^0$	$K^0 \rightarrow \pi^+ \pi^-$
to study	$\gamma d \rightarrow \Lambda K^+ n$	$\Theta^+ \rightarrow nK^+$	$\Lambda \rightarrow p\pi^{-}$
	$\gamma d \rightarrow \Lambda K^0 p$	$\Theta^+ \rightarrow pK^0$	$\Lambda \rightarrow p\pi^{-} K^{0} \rightarrow \pi^{+}\pi^{-}$



Decay modes: $\Theta^+ \rightarrow K^0 p \quad \Lambda \rightarrow p\pi^- \quad K^0 \rightarrow \pi^+ \pi^ \Theta^+ \rightarrow K^+ n \quad \Lambda \rightarrow p\pi^-$

No possibility of kinematical reflections

 (A.R. Dzierba et al., hep-ph/0311125)
 S=+1 both for nK⁺ and pK⁰, thanks to Λ

Gza ana GIU Comparison				
$\gamma d \rightarrow p$	oK⁺K⁻(n)			
G2 Data Set		G10 Data Set		
E _e = <mark>2.478</mark> GeV (2/3 of G2a)	E _e = 3.775 (GeV		
E _y < 2.35 GeV	E _γ < 2.35 Ge	eV		
Torus Current = 3375 A	Torus Curre	ent = 3375 A		
Target 10 cm LD2; center of CLAS	Target 24 c	m LD2; -25 cm upstream o		
	CLAS cente	r		

1 C10 C

C 2



G2a and G10 Comparison

 Λ (1520) and ϕ



Data Taking Data taking May 22 - July 26, 2004
E_γ = 1.6 - 3.8 GeV
Target = 40 cm liquid hydrogen
Events collected ~ 80 pb⁻¹ (10x statistic published results)

Data Processing Status

End of February 2005: final data processing \rightarrow bos files and ntuples with 4-vectors ready for physics analysis

Reactions to study

 $g+p \rightarrow Q^{+} + K^{0} \rightarrow K^{+} + n (K^{0} + p) p^{+} + p^{-}$ $g+p \rightarrow X^{++} + K^{-} \rightarrow K^{+} + p + K^{-}$ $g+p \rightarrow Q^{+} + K^{-} + p^{+} \rightarrow K^{+} + n (K^{0} + p) + K^{-} + p^{+}$



Development and test of the analysis procedure through the cross section extraction for known reactions

$$\gamma \mathbf{p} \rightarrow \mathbf{p} \boldsymbol{\omega}$$

Differential cross section $\rightarrow p p^+(p^- p^0)$ Topology 1

 \rightarrow p p ⁺ p ⁻ (p ⁰) Topology 2



 $\gamma p \rightarrow K + \Lambda(1116)$ Differential cross section

→ K⁺ p (p⁻) Topology 1 L as
$$MM_{K^+}$$

→ K⁺ p p⁻ Topology 2 L as IM_{pp^-}



 $\begin{array}{l} \gamma \mathbf{p} \rightarrow \mathbf{K} + \Lambda(1116) \\ \gamma \mathbf{p} \rightarrow \mathbf{p} \, \omega \end{array} \\ \end{array} Total cross sections$



EG3: Search for Pentaguark Cascades



EG3: Search for Pentaquark Cascades

• CLAS allows simultaneous detection of multiple particles in the final state. In particular channel



EG3: Search for Pentaquark Cascades

Data Taking Data taking Dec 5 2005- January 31, 2005
E_γ = 4.4 - 5.5 GeV
Target = 40 cm liquid deuterium
Events collected ~ 4.2 Billion

Analysis Plan

Develop procedures to identify detached vertices with ~1cm resolution.

Identify Λ using ($p\pi^{-}$) missing mass.

Identify Ξ^{-} using ($\Lambda\pi^{-}$) invariant mass, DOCA and flight path.

Plot invariant mass of $(\Xi^{-} \pi^{-})$ to find Ξ^{--} peak.

Develop/utilize kinematical fitting procedure to enhance peaks and use confidence level cuts.

New data: LEPS deuterium



Hope with CLAS to give soon a final answer on the pentaquark issue